

1995

## Book Review (reviewing Rudolf Weigand, Die Glossen zum Dekret Gratians (1991))

Richard H. Helmholz

Follow this and additional works at: [http://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/journal\\_articles](http://chicagounbound.uchicago.edu/journal_articles)

 Part of the [Law Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

Richard. H. Helmholz, "Book Review (reviewing Rudolf Weigand, Die Glossen zum Dekret Gratians (1991))," 64 Church History 458 (1995).

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Faculty Scholarship at Chicago Unbound. It has been accepted for inclusion in Journal Articles by an authorized administrator of Chicago Unbound. For more information, please contact [unbound@law.uchicago.edu](mailto:unbound@law.uchicago.edu).

scholarly dialogue that one scribe could pick up the gloss where another had left off!

The community's activities had a characteristically practical emphasis. That was expressed in their concern for moral and disciplinary questions in a life of Christian perfection and the books they produced on those topics. Among Salisbury's collection are to be found standard eleventh-century monastic texts of Cassian's *Collationes*, Smaragdus's *Diadema monachorum*, and *Sermones ad monachos* of Caesarius and Eusebius's "Gallicanus." Early-twelfth-century efforts produced the *Praeceptum* and the *Rule of the Four Fathers* as well as the *Scala Virtutum*, a unique Salisbury *florilegium* of biblical and patristic quotations on personal discipline. And the *Meditationes Godwini Cantoris*, a twelfth-century work of more certain Salisbury origin by the precentor Godwin, argues that the ascent to perfection is available in all walks of life, not just in monastic life. Webber sees bibliographic evidence of the canons' practical concern for the virtuous life in the midst of their scholarly activities.

All this solid detective work, together with clear facsimiles of a number of the scribal hands, is an impressive contribution to our understanding of Anglo-Norman culture and early English cathedral life.

*The University of Dayton*  
Dayton, Ohio

PAUL F. VIESON

*Die Glossen zum Dekret Gratians.* By RUDOLF WEIGAND. *Studia Gratiana* 25 and 26. Rome: Libreria Ateneo Salesiano, 1991. xxiv + vii + 1042 pp. \$136.00.

This is a learned and technical work of scholarship that will be of importance to historians of medieval canon law. It makes a real advance in understanding the composition and transmission of glosses, the marginal or interlinear notes clarifying and enlarging upon the canonical texts. Glosses were one of the most characteristic forms of medieval scholastic commentary, and at least in the law, they determined the common understanding of the texts themselves—hence their importance. This work's author, Rudolf Weigand, has been a leader in attempting to piece together the history of the subject. Here he both pulls together his prior work and breaks new ground, most notably by exploiting possibilities opened up by the computer.

The base for this effort is the great textbook of the classical canon law, the *Concordantia discordantium canonum*, known familiarly as the *Decretum*. The traditional view has long been that the *Decretum* was compiled in 1140 by a Camaldolese monk named Gratian who taught in Bologna, but uncertainties about the text have long abounded, including uncertainties about the *glossa ordinaria* to it. Manuscripts of it survive in large numbers from the Middle Ages, and they show that it was glossed from the start. To understand the nature of this glossing, Weigand first selected six different parts of the

*Decretum* as representative samples. Then he recorded the glosses to the texts that are found in 196 manuscripts preserved in libraries throughout Europe and even the United States. To each different gloss he assigned a number (about 2100 in all), noting the manuscripts in which each appeared. Thus, when the same gloss appears in several manuscripts, this duplication is readily apparent and identifiable by referring to the number assigned. Some of the glosses are unique; some repeated in dozens of manuscripts. Some are lengthy and informative; some are a word or two in length and add little to the text. They are printed here *in extenso* (pp. 1–392).

Making the glosses available is not, however, the principal aim of this volume. It is simply a happy by-product. Weigand's purpose is to answer some of the perplexing problems that have long confronted (and confounded) historians of canon law. They involve questions of dating the different glosses, identifying their authors, placing them into a geographical or scholastic context, and (above all) understanding their internal relationships. Which, for example, were the earliest glosses? And how did transmission of particular glosses and ideas occur? The computer allows Weigand to approach these questions in much less haphazard ways than was previously possible. For example, the same gloss did not always appear at the same place in every manuscript where it appeared. It is the computer that enables the connection between them to be made. It is the computer that allows a story of transmission to be worked out and the relative importance of different glosses to be evaluated.

Not all puzzles yield their secrets, even to a computer. But many do, and Weigand's conclusions and observations about the puzzles are set out in two long sections. The first (pp. 393–660) separates out and discusses the various glossators, some known, some anonymous. It includes much new information on the earliest decretists. The second (pp. 661–1004) describes the manuscripts. It naturally concentrates upon the glosses found in them, but it contains much other information besides, and users of these manuscripts will want to consult the entries for them found herein. In sum, this is a product of effort and erudition. The editors of *Studia Gratiana* deserve the thanks of scholars for undertaking its publication.

University of Chicago  
Chicago, Illinois

R. H. HELMHOLZ

*Victory in the East: A Military History of the First Crusade.* By JOHN FRANCE.  
Cambridge, U.K.: Cambridge University Press, 1994. xv + 425 pp. \$54.95.

Crusade historiography has recently moved in the direction of military history and away from crusade ideology, as exemplified in Christopher